

## **On Background: What's the real story behind the deceptively edited videos?**

Since July 2015, anti-abortion activists have leveled a new series of false claims against Planned Parenthood that have been widely discredited and debunked. They have used heavily edited videos to make false claims about fetal tissue donation that patients at a small number of Planned Parenthood affiliates request. Mainstream media, forensic analysts, and even the creator of the videos, David Daleiden, have since proven and confirmed that the smear campaign videos were heavily edited.

### **Forensic Report**

[On September 25, 2015](#), the Chair and Ranking Member of the House Oversight and Government Reform Committee [received a letter](#) from a [leading forensic video expert](#), explaining that unless anti-abortion extremist David Daleiden turns over original source footage of all of his recordings, the footage cannot be authenticated.

- [Letter to the Chair and Ranking Member of the House Oversight and Government Reform](#)
- [Committee Credentials of Douglas S. Lacey](#)

### **Key Quotes from the Report:**

- “The short videos take a great deal of dialog out of context so as to substantively and significantly alter the meaning of the dialog contained in the long videos.”
- “CMP edited content out of the alleged ‘full footage’ videos, and heavily edited the short videos so as to misrepresent statements made by Planned Parenthood representatives.”
- “[T]he short videos significantly distort and misrepresent the conversations in the full footage videos. Mr. Fredericks notes that the short videos contain ‘edited conversations where some spoken words are eliminated and some spoken words are added out of context.’”
- “At this point, it is impossible to characterize the extent to which CMP’s undisclosed edits and cuts distort the meaning of the encounters the videos purport to document. However, the manipulation of the videos does mean they have no evidentiary value in a legal context and cannot be relied upon for any official inquiries unless supplemented by CMP’s original material and forensic authentication that this material is supplied in unaltered form.”
- Along with the expert report, Planned Parenthood compiled a short breakdown of the heavy, deceptive editing in the five videos.

### **Fact Sheet from the Forensics Report**

Key data from the summary:

- Collectively, the five videos of Planned Parenthood staff have at least 42 splices where content is cut and edited together to create the appearance of seamless conversations.
- On one video, a Planned Parenthood staff member in Colorado says 13 separate times that any arrangements related to fetal tissue donation need to be reviewed by attorneys and follow all laws – and all 13 are edited out of the video.
- On another video, a Planned Parenthood staff member in Texas says nine separate times that there is no “profit” related to fetal tissue donation – and all nine are edited out of the video.

## **David Daleiden Admits to Deceptively Editing Videos**

On October 20, 2015 [David Daleiden got caught](#) in his own lies and [admitted](#) what we already know -- that he and others have heavily edited videos intended to attack Planned Parenthood. In an interview with CNN, [Daleiden not only conceded to deceptively editing the videos](#), but also acknowledged that video and images he used have nothing to do with Planned Parenthood.

- [David Daleiden on CNN](#)

### **Mainstream Media Agrees: The Video's Claims Are Clearly Untrue**

**[New York Times](#):** "A hidden-camera video released last week purported to show that Planned Parenthood illegally sells tissue from aborted fetuses. It shows nothing of the sort....Clearly, the shorter version was edited to eliminate statements by Dr. Nucatola explaining that Planned Parenthood does not profit from tissue donation, which requires the clear consent of the patient."

**[Washington Post](#):** "The group behind the sting edited a three-hour meeting down to eight minutes of detailed medical description, then blasted it across the country proclaiming that they have evidence that Planned Parenthood is harvesting baby parts for profit. Um, no — not even remotely....The truth is, this video is nothing more than another one of those graphic abortion protest posters of mutilated fetuses waved at people and passing children on the street. Totally out of context and totally horrible."

**[NPR](#):** "Despite massive media coverage and a rush by Republicans to investigate, Daleiden's videos so far contain no evidence that Planned Parenthood has done anything illegal."

**[Politifact](#):** "Put simply, there's no clear gotcha."

**[Buzzfeed](#):** "But, according to the spokesperson for StemExpress, a real California biotech company that has a contract to purchase the tissue from Planned Parenthood, the nonprofit is most likely losing money on these exchanges....'If anything they're losing money,' the spokesperson, who spoke on the condition of anonymity, said. 'I hope they're breaking even.' He added, 'I just don't see how Planned Parenthood could be profiting.'"

**[Gawker](#):** "This is a case of words being taken grossly out of context."

**[FactCheck.org](#):** "But the full, unedited video they cite as evidence shows a Planned Parenthood executive repeatedly saying its clinics want to cover their costs, not make money, when donating fetal tissue from abortions for scientific research....In reality, \$30-100 probably constitutes a loss for [Planned Parenthood]. The costs associated with collection, processing, storage, and inventory and records management for specimens are very high."

**[Slate](#):** "This video, unsurprisingly, is being received with a whimper in the media....Despite CMP's attempts to make it look like Planned Parenthood medical director Mary Gatter is "selling" fetal tissue, she repeatedly makes it clear that is not an option."

**[The New York Times](#):** "While the video...alleges that Planned Parenthood is guilty of the crime of selling fetal remains, the official tells her questioners more than once that the cost, \$30 to \$100, is reimbursement for clinics' expenses."

**[MSNBC](#):** "The group that recorded a secret video of Planned Parenthood's senior director of medical services says it shows "how Planned Parenthood sells the body parts of aborted fetuses, and admitting she

uses partial-birth abortions to supply intact body parts.” But their own transcript contains several clear statements to dispute that.”

**Yahoo:** “The video, through not-so-subtle editing, implies that Planned Parenthood is in the business of encouraging women to abort fetuses so that the organization may then sell the fetal parts for profit. Nucatola appears to say that it costs \$30 to \$100 purchase baby organs. This has been markedly denounced as untrue by both Planned Parenthood itself and outside journalistic entities.”

**Guardian:** “The truth of the video, however – which was released by a previously unheard-of organization led by a man who has described himself as an “amateur varanid keeper” – is that it shows nothing illegal.”

**The Nation:** The video, long on misleading editing and short on any evidence for its claims of illegal behavior, had all the hallmarks of right-wing agitprop.

**Huffington Post:** “Donating the fetal tissue for research at the request of some of its patients, which is legal.”

**International Business Times:** In the unedited version of the video, Nucatola was discussing the cost of "space issues" and shipping...However, the viral video makes it seem as if she is telling the actors -- who were hired by the activist group -- about the cost of fetal tissue.

**MSNBC:** “It’s not clear why the *Washington Post* put the story literally on the front page, since there are no credible allegations of wrongdoing.”

**Slate:** “But the legal accusations are just the fluff, easy to disprove and not really the point of the video”

**Mother Jones:** “As near as I can tell, it’s completely bogus. The video tries to imply that Planned Parenthood is performing illegal abortions and that it’s selling fetal tissue for profit, also a felony. But there’s not the slightest evidence of either. In fact, as Media Matters points out, if you watch the unedited video it’s crystal clear that the charges for the fetal tissue they sell are designed only to cover the actual costs of the process. Nucatola says repeatedly that affiliates want to “break even,” not make a profit.”

**Refinery29:** “The video was quickly revealed to have been heavily edited — and by a group with a history of such distortions — in a way that warps the reproductive healthcare organization’s involvement in tissue-donation programs.”

**Salon:** “First, let’s acknowledge the sting for what it is — the latest addition to an ongoing game of what we’ll call Deceitful Anti-Choice Mad Libs.”

**NY Daily News:** Undercover Planned Parenthood videos were altered by abortion opponents: analysis “Statements were spliced together at least 42 times to appear like seamless conversations, the analysis found. Two of the videos were each missing 30-minute chunks of footage... CMP’s ‘undisclosed edits and cuts distort the meaning of the encounters the videos purport to document,’ the analysis said.”

**MSNBC:** Planned Parenthood: Even ‘full’ videos were altered “The research firm also found that the transcripts provided by the Center for Medical Progress are inaccurate as judged against a transcript made by an independent service. ‘All four transcripts by CMP contain substantive omissions, and the Texas transcript appears to be grossly edited,’ the Fusion GPS report says.”

[Reuters](#): Planned Parenthood report says fetal tissue videos were distorted " 'Any time someone has made undisclosed changes to an audio or video file, that renders the file unreliable,' lead investigator and former Wall Street Journal investigative reporter Glenn Simpson said during a media conference call."

[Vox](#): I thought I saw all the Planned Parenthood sting footage. Turns out the tapes were edited. "The inaccurate transcript and the jumping timestamps make a pretty compelling case that I didn't get the full picture. CMP can't just wave away the missing footage as boring bathroom breaks; it's impossible to know what might be missing without complete video. If the group wants to present these as the full videos behind the sting operation, then it needs to actually provide the complete footage — however dull or boring those other parts might be."

[San Jose Mercury News](#): "The videos are grossly misleading and politically irresponsible."

[Los Angeles Times](#): "Leaving aside the potential violation of California law, which forbids recording a person without consent, the narrative pushed by the anti-abortion activists is a total crock."

[Houston Chronicle](#): "The footage initially was released in an edited form that made it look like Nucatola was talking about selling fetal organs, which is illegal. The full video indicates that the subject likely was legal organ donation, and the discussed costs were to perform the preservation."

[The Seattle Times](#): "The videos make it appear that compassionate doctors are violating the law. In actuality, providers in these videos spoke at length following strict ethical guidelines and about not making a profit from any donations. In fact, it appears the only lawbreakers are the group who orchestrated elaborate lies in an attempt to discredit doctors who care about the health and well-being of women."

[Chicago Sun-Times](#): "As a medical ethicist and lawyer, the headlines concerned me. But after scrutinizing hours of video, it appears Planned Parenthood doctors are complying with federal law allowing 'reasonable payments' for collection of fetal tissue. As the organization's senior director of medical services explains in the unedited version of her videotaped meeting with people posing as members of the research community, abortion clinics 'want to offer this service because patients ask about it. ... just as much as the patients, the providers absolutely want to help [medical research].'"

[Michigan Public Radio](#): "Planned Parenthood has been saving women and families from poverty and desperation for 99 years. Now, its enemies are 'swift boating' it; presenting lies and distortions as fact."

[Austin Chronicle](#): "...much context has been left out of the anti-choice response. For one, consider the source: Texas conservatives and other GOPers are eating up dubious claims from the Center For Medical Progress – an ardently anti-choice group associated with Live Action, known to release heavily edited videos that have historically targeted Planned Parenthood. And one of CMP's founders (Troy Newman) heads Operation Rescue, a group that advocated harassing abortion clinic workers and [ran a decades-long campaign](#) against murdered abortion doctor Dr. George Tiller."

#### **General Video Breakdown from Media Matters:**

- [First Video: Uses Deceptive Edits To Claim Planned Parenthood Is Illegally Selling Fetal Tissue](#)

- [Second Video: Edited To Make Planned Parenthood Look Like It Is "Haggling Over Payments"](#)
- [Third Video: Ex-StemExpress Employee Claims Planned Parenthood Profits From Fetal Tissue Sales](#)
- [Fourth Video: Edited Video Implies Planned Parenthood Is Hiding Criminal Acts](#)
- [Fifth Video: Edited To Make Planned Parenthood Official Appear To Agree To Alter Abortion Procedures For Profit](#)
- [Sixth Video: Ex-StemExpress Employee Alleges Fetal Tissue Sometimes Collected Without Consent](#)
- [Seventh Video: Ex-StemExpress Employee Discusses Tissue Procurement](#)
- [Eighth Video: Features StemExpress CEO, Claims To Document "Sale Of Aborted Baby Parts"](#)
- [Ninth Video: Planned Parenthood: "The Video Released... Is Not About Planned Parenthood"](#)
- [10th Video: Four Planned Parenthood Officials Discuss Fetal Tissue Compliance And Stigma](#)
- [11th Video: Attempts, And Fails, To Smear Texas Planned Parenthood Doctor](#)
- [Independent Analysis Finds Evidence Of "Manipulation" In Undercover Videos](#)
- [Media Have Roundly Called Out CMP For Accusing Planned Parenthood Of Illegal Acts, Which Videos Don't Show](#)
- [Background On The Shady, Anti-Choice Group Behind The Deceptive Videos](#)
- [Multiple Investigations Into Allegations Have Found No Illegal Activity By Planned Parenthood](#)